BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 10078725 8

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

MEDIA AND DEFAMATION LAW

(LAW 369H1S)

Bert Bruser and Paul Schabas

CASES AND MATERIALS

(2016 – 2017)

VOLUME I

KE
1246
.B78
2016
v.1
c.1

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

DEC 2 0 2016

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

MEDIA AND DEFAMATION LAW

(LAW 369H1S)

Bert Bruser and Paul Schabas

CASES AND MATERIALS

(2016 – 2017)

VOLUME I

MEDIA AND DEFAMATION LAW

(LAW 369H1S)

Bert Bruser and Paul Schabas

CASES AND MATERIALS

(2016-2017)

CONTENTS **PAGE**

VOLUME I - LIBEL

1. What is defamatory and who can sue? 1
Robertson & Nicol, *Media Law* (excerpts) 2
"Some in Huntsville 'getting nervous'" 9
Youssoupoff v. Metro-Goldwyn-Mayer Pictures Ltd (1934), 50 T.L.R. 581 (C.A.) 12
"Canada slow to accept Haitian rape risk" 17
"Why are so many gays still hiding in the closet?" 20
"Correction: Columnist meant to say singer supports equality" 21
"'Son of a bitch' not libellous; 'sick son of a bitch' is" 22
"Nic At Nite: A tale of hooters and heifers in old Hogtown" 23
"Dorothy Parsons clenched the sink" 30
Lewis v. Daily Telegraph Ltd., [1963] 2 All ER 151 31
"Singled out" 39
Gauthier v. Toronto Star (2003), 228 D.L.R (4th) 748 (Ont. Sup. Ct.), aff'd (2004) 45 D.L.R. (4th) 169 (Ont. C.A.) 41
Malhab v. Diffusion Metromedia CMR Inc., 2011 SCC 9 (excerpts) 48
"Tenants seek ouster of priest, directors" 68
"Rob Ford told he was unwelcome as a football coach at Toronto high school," *Toronto Star,* July 13, 2010 69
Rob Ford Libel Notice 73

2. Defences to Libel 80
(a) Truth/Justification 81
"Rob Ford in 'crack cocaine' video scandal," *Toronto Star,* May 16, 2013 82
"Police chief for Niagara not picked: Commission" 86
Sidorsky v. CFCN Communications Ltd (1994), 23 Alta. L.R. (3d) 116 (Q.B.) (excerpts) 87
PG Restaurant Ltd v. Northern Interior Health Board, 2005 BCCA 210 88

(b) Fair Comment 101
"Paradise lost at Passe Muraille – First-night theatre-goers says things went all to pot" 102
Transcript of CKNW broadcast, October 25, 1999 103
WIC Radio, et al. v. Kari Simpson, 2008 SCC 40 105

"Conspiracy" cartoon by Josh Beutel 129
"Killer was drawn to others' online rage," *Toronto Star*, July 29, 2011 130
"Melanie Phillips Apology," *Toronto Star*, Aug. 26, 2011 132
Defamation Act 2013 (UK), s. 3 133

(c) Privilege 134
"Developer ordered to clean up land near houses" 135
"Reodica" article 136
McCarton Turkington Breen v. Times Newspapers, [2001] 2 AC 277 138

(d) Responsible Communication 147
New York Times Co. v Sullivan, 376 U.S. 254 (1964) 148
Hill v. Church of Scientology, [1995] 2 S.C.R. 1130 (excerpts) 174
"Saudi Officials Monitor Certain Bank Accounts – Focus is on those with Potential Terrorist Ties", *Wall Street Journal*, Feb. 6, 2002 208
Jameel v. Wall Street Journal, [2007] 1 AC 359 210
Defamation Act 2013 (UK), s. 4 234
Grant v. Torstar Corp., 2009 SCC 61 235
"Adam Giambrone says sorry for relationship with young woman" 266
"CBC fires Jian Ghomeshi over sex allegations," *Toronto Star,* Nov. 4, 2014 268
"Why the Star chose to publish Jian Ghomeshi allegations" *Toronto Star,* Nov. 4, 2014 272
"Nursing home residents abused," *Toronto Star,* November 17, 2011 274
"Star reporters buy cheap U.S. gun, no ID required," *Toronto Star,* April 12, 2013 281
"Ford pal's hunt for cell sparked probe," *Toronto Star,* October 8, 2013 287
"OPC Decision: Donley Vs Toronto Star, October 2013," *Ontario Press Council* 289
New York Times Letter to Donald Trump, October 13, 2016 294

3. Malice 296
Horrocks v. Lowe, [1975] AC 135 (HL) 297
Paul v. Cheng, [2000] HKCFA 88 306

4. Apologies/Corrections 322
Murray Alter's Talent Associates Ltd. v. Toronto Star Newspapers Ltd., [1995] 124 D.L.R. (4th) 105 (Ont. Div. Ct.) 323
Sun Media Retraction and Apology to George Soros 339
"Disgraced Local 183 union executive…" 340
"OPP Grilled McGuinty," *Ottawa Citizen,* June 6, 2014 341
"Citizen apologizes to McGuinty," *Ottawa Citizen,* September 5, 2014 343

5. Damages 344
Walker v. CFTO Ltd. (1987), 59 OR (2d) 104 (C.A.) 345
Skene, Canadian Defamation Verdicts (to September 30, 2016) 357

6. Defamation and the Internet 377
(i) Liability for Comments 378
Bunt v. Tilley, [2006] EWHC 407 (QB) 379

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/mediadefamationl01brus_8

United States *Communications Decency Act*, 47 U.S.C. § 230 (excerpt)....387
Weaver v. Corcoran, 2015 BCSC 165....388

(ii) Hyperlinks....395
Crookes v. Newton, 2011 SCC 47 (excerpts)....396

(iii)Libel or Slander, or ?....411
Baglow v. Smith, 2011 ONSC 5131....412
Baglow v. Smith, [2012] O.J. No. 2668 (C.A.)....427
Barrick Gold Corp. v. Lopehandia, [2004] O.J. No. 2329 (C.A.) (excerpts)....429
Smith v. ADVFN plc, [2008] EWHC 1797 (QB) (excerpts)....436
"Internet chat more likely slander than libel, says High Court"....438
"Mosley orgy judge blocks web forum libel writ onslaught"....440
"Rats Feast at Dumpling House"....443
Public message board on www.blogto.com website....445
Public message board on *Toronto Star* website (screenshot)....450
"Helping towns cope with sprawl"....451

(iv)Notice and Publication....453
Times Newspapers (Nos. 1 and 2) v. U.K., [2009] ECHR 3002/03....454
Shtaif v. Toronto Life Publishing Co. Ltd., 2013 ONCA 405....466

(v) Jurisdiction....500
Black v. Breeden, [2012] SCJ No. 19....501
Editions Ecosociété Inc. v. Banro Corp., 2012 SCC 18....513
U.S. SPEECH Act, H.R. 2765 (2010)....518
"Libel Without Borders"....522
Defamation Act 2013 (UK), s.9....523
Goldhar v. Haaretz.com, 2016 ONCA 515....526
Equustek Solutions Inc. v. Jack, 2015 BCCA 265....594

7. Legislation....630
Libel and Slander Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. L.12....531
United Kingdom Defamation Act 2013....636
Ontario, Bill 52, *Protection of Public Participation Act*, 2015....648

VOLUME II - PRIVACY AND NEWSGATHERING

8. Privacy....656
Vice-Versa magazine, June 1988....657
Jones v. Tsige, 2012 ONCA 32....658
Royal Family Photos....699
Mosley v. News Group Newspapers, [2008] EWHC 1777 (QB) (excerpts)....701
"Max Mosley goes forum shopping in Paris," *The Independent*, 4 June 2008....712
"Google Street View worries privacy experts"....714
"Google contravened Canadian privacy law, investigation finds," Office of the Privacy Commissioner of Canada....716
"Seniors at risk in retirement home, investigation reveals"....719
Chandra v. CBC, 2015 ONSC 5303....722

Jane Doe 464533 v. D. (N.), 2016 ONSC 541 737

9. "Right to be Forgotten" 757
Google Spain SL, Google Inc. v Agencia Española de Protección de Datos, Mario Costeja González, Case C-131/12 of 13 May 2014 758
"The longtail of news: to unpublish or not to unpublish" 783
Right to be forgotten': How Canada could adopt similar law for online privacy," CBC News, June 16, 2014 805
"Google ordered to erase all sex images of F1 chief Mosley," *Toronto Star,* Nov. 6, 2013 809
"Former German First Lady Sues Google…" 810
"Google hit with $200,000 damages…" 812

10. Open Courts 814
Edmonton Journal v. Alberta, [1989] 2 S.C.R. 1326 815

11. Publication Bans 832
(i) Common Law / Discretionary Bans 833
"Gagged" (Tori Stafford murder case) 834
"The criminal case you can't know about," *Toronto Star*, Nov. 2, 2011 836
"Star challenging publication ban that keeps identities of toddler and parents who killed her secret," *Toronto Star,* October 27, 2014 838
"Secrecy and the 'open courts' principle: Public Editor," *Toronto Star*, Mar. 18, 2016 841
"Experts shocked by publication ban," *Toronto Star*, Nov. 3, 2011 843
"Karla Teale convicted" 844
Dagenais v. CBC, [1994] 3 S.C.R. 835 846
R. v. Mentuck, 2001 SCC 76 862
R. v. Kossyrine & Vorobiov, 2011 ONSC 6081 879
M.E.H. v. Russell Williams, 2012 ONCA 35 886
A.B. v. Bragg Communications Inc., [2012] S.C.O. No. 46 913

(ii) Statutory Bans 921
Toronto Star Newspapers Ltd. v. Canada, 2010 SCC 21 922
"Respected teacher had 'dark side,' court told – Kingston man faces sex charges" 936
"How sex-attack case faltered," and apology 937
"Claim allowed to proceed over breach of publication ban" 939
Jan Wong, "On naming names in sexual assault" 940
"[Redacted]: 1 Year Probation for Manslaughter – 2009 draft pick [redacted] talks to Point Blank" 941

12. Access 944
(i) Exhibits 945
"Justice is blind, and in Ontario, it's also becoming mute" 946
R. v. Canadian Broadcasting Corporation, 2010 ONCA 726 948
Canadian Broadcasting Corp. v. The Queen, 2011 SCC 3 (excerpts) 958
Investigation into a Secret Court: Here's what we found," *Toronto Star*, Oct. 29, 2011 966
Toronto Star v. Ontario, [2012] O.J. No. 198 968

"Access to exhibits still denied, media lawyers say," *Law Times,* October 17, 2011 988
"Why the media lawyer was pushing the Ghomeshi Judge to reveal a bikini photo," *National Post*, Feb. 4, 2016 989

(ii) ITOs..... 991
Toronto Star Newspapers Ltd. v. Ontario, 2005 SCC 41 992
The Globe and Mail and Others v. HMQ, 2013 ONSC 6836.....1000
Canadian Broadcasting Corporation and Others v. HMQ, 2013 ONSC 6983.....1016

(iii)Tribunals.....1029
Order of the Information and Privacy Commissioner of Ontario – Human Rights Tribunal of Ontario, October 21, 2010 1030
Ontario (Minister of Finance) v. Ontario (Information and Privacy Commissioner), 2012 ONCA 125 1043
"Guidance Document: Electronic Disclosure of Personal Information in the Decisions of Administrative Tribunals," *Office of the Privacy Commissioner*, February 2010 1057

13. Contempt 1062
Bert Bruser, "Often my views are unpopular".....1063
"A 25 year old drifter".....1064
"Seasoned police officers".....1065
"It was an easy arrest".....1066
"The Toronto police officer".....1067
"Cocaine Trial Begins".....1068
"Dad faces retrial in baby death".....1069
"2 suspects charged in slaying of boy, 11".....1070
"Suspect 'well-known' to police".....1071

14. Sources and Search Warrants 1072
(i) Search Warrants and Production Orders.....1073
CBC c. Lessard, [1991] 3 S.C.R. 421.....1074
R. v. Vice Media Canada Inc., 2016 ONSC 1961.....1084

(ii) Confidential Sources.....1120
Reid v. Telegram Publishing Co., [1961] OR 418 (S.C.) 1121
R. v. National Post, 2010 SCC 16.....1128
Globe and Mail v. Canada (A.G.), 2010 SCC 41 1156
"Press freedom weighs heavily in confidential-source cases," *Globe and Mail,* 31 Mar 2013...1177
"Quebec to hold public inquiry into police surveillance of journalists", *Globe and Mail*, November 3, 2016.....1179
Contempt of Court Act (United Kingdom), 1981 c.49, section 10 1181

(iii)Breaking the Law.....1183
"Untangling the News of the World scandal: A Timeline," *National Post*, July 15, 2011 1184
"Star investigation: Slacking off gets high marks at this 'high school,'" *Toronto Star*, Sept. 16, 2011 1187
"Dealing With Assange and the WikiLeaks Secrets," *NYT Magazine*, Jan. 26, 2011.....1191
"NSA files: why the Guardian in London destroyed hard drives of leaked files," *The Guardian*, 20 Aug, 2013 1209

15. Statutory Provisions.....1213
Criminal Code, excerpts 1214
Youth Criminal Justice Act, excerpts.....1221
Courts of Justice Act, excerpts. 1227